

Singapore JOBS
www.sciencecareers.org/singapore/

IS YOUR EVENT INCLUDED?

[SCIENCE ONLINE](#) [SCIENCE MAGAZINE HOME](#) [SCIENCE NOW](#) [NEXT WAVE](#) [STKE/AIDS/SAGE](#) [SCIENCE CAREERS](#) [E-MARKETPLACE](#)

Institution: University of Toronto | [Sign In as Individual](#) | [FAQ](#) | [Access Rights](#) | [Join AAAS](#)

Science
magazine

[HELP](#) [SUBSCRIPTIONS](#) [FEEDBACK](#) [SIGN IN](#) 

[SEARCH](#) [BROWSE](#)

[▶ ORDER THIS ARTICLE](#)

David Avnir *et al.* (*Science's Compass*, 2 Jan., [p. 39](#)) pose the question, "Is the geometry of **nature** fractal?" By considering results from 96 reports that have claimed **fractality in** natural systems, they show that the declared **fractality** spans on the average only about 1.5 decades (orders of magnitude). Accordingly, they question the practice of associating power laws over such a limited range of scales with fractal processes that by definition extend to an **infinite** range of scales.

This is a legitimate question, and I agree that natural systems are not described by simple scale-free models and that limited scaling may arise from random processes. There is, however, another possibility. Natural systems **involve** mechanisms and processes operating at different ranges of space-time scales. The climate system is a good example. The processes at those different scales may or may not **interact** with one other, but if they are fractal, their properties and scaling may be different and limited to the corresponding scales.

This **kind** of result can often provide useful **insights** about the physics and processes underlying the physical system **in** question. As such, the real issue is not whether or not we label the power law a fractal, but whether or not it is the appropriate fit to the data. **In** most studies, the power law is determined by the slope of a **linear** region **in** a log-log plot. **In** such plots, it is easy to visually identify narrow regions that appear **linear**. **In** effect, **in** most cases a power law is not proved, but is a priori assumed to exist. Very few studies (**including** those **in** the 96 reports) ask whether or not the data **in** the range of scales of the alleged power law are consistent with the corresponding family of true fractals or even if the power law is **indeed** the best fit to the data. This question is not always easy to answer, but **in** certain cases (self-affine processes, for example) statistical tests can be used to provide an answer ([1](#)).

▶ **dEbate:** [Submit a response to this article](#)

▶ [Download to Citation Manager](#)

▶ Alert me when: [new articles cite this article](#)

▶ Search for similar articles **in**:
[Science Online](#)
[PubMed](#)

▶ Search **Medline** for articles by:
[Tsonis; , A. A.](#) || [Avnir, D.](#)

A. A. Tsonis
Department of Geosciences,
University of Wisconsin,
Milwaukee, WI 53201, USA
E-mail: aatsonis@csd.uwm.edu

References

1. A. A. Tsonis and J. B. Elsner, *J. Stat. Phys.* **81**, 869 (1995).
-

Response: Tsonis raises two important issues--the possible origin of the limited range of empirical fractals and the practice of fitting data to a power law when there is no theoretical model that suggests the suitability of such analysis. **Indeed**, we also believe that the question of the origin and abundance of the limited-range fractals is the central issue. Theories that predict power-law scaling have been proposed and studied extensively for both equilibrium critical phenomena and nonequilibrium processes.

It seems to us, however, that the diversity of experiments and phenomena and the fact that most observations

are as yet without a solid theoretical background call for a fresh look at the general phenomenon of empirical fractals with a limited range. Without claiming that we have an answer at hand, we do mention, as an example, an **interesting finding** we made, namely, that randomness, either **in** its elementary, uncorrelated forms or superimposed with **internal** correlations, generates apparent fractal structures below medium densities over one to two decades ([1](#)).

The question then, as correctly raised by Tsonis, is how can one distinguish between power laws that are the result of such non-mechanistic phenomena, and **inherent** power laws that fully justify the use of this analysis. We reiterate here the usefulness of the limited-range apparent fractals, even **in** the absence of an underlying theoretical justification (as we detailed **in** our *Science* piece). The detection and **interpretation** of **inherent** power laws requires scale-free theories and models. For some systems and processes, such theories and models exist, as mentioned above, while for others they are still needed. **In** any event, this task is far from **being** complete. We are currently developing **guidelines** and recommendations for the detection and analysis of fractal structures that are bound with **in** cutoffs; these will be reported separately.

Ofer Biham*

Ofer Malcai

Racah **I**nstitute of Physics,

Hebrew University,

Jerusalem 91904, Israel

*E-mail: biham@flounder.fiz.huji.ac.il

Daniel A. Lidar

Department of Chemistry,

University of California,

Berkeley, CA 94720, USA

David Avnir

Institute of Chemistry *and*

Lise-Meitner **M**inerva Center for
Computational Quantum Chemistry,

Hebrew University,

Jerusalem 91904. Israel

References

1. D. Hamburger, O. Biham, D. Avnir, *Phys. Rev. E* **53**, 3342 (1996).

[How to Submit a Letter to the Editor](#)

▶ **dE**bates: [Submit a response to this article](#)

▶ [Download to Citation Manager](#)

- ▶ Alert me when:
[new articles cite this article](#)

- ▶ Search for similar articles **in**:
[Science Online](#)
[PubMed](#)
- ▶ Search Medline for articles by:
[Tsonis;, A. A.](#) || [Avnir, D.](#)

Volume 279, Number 5357, Issue of 13 Mar 1998, p. 1611.

Copyright © 1998 by The American Association for the Advancement of Science. All rights reserved.

Find out about products
advertised in *Science*...



▲ PAGE TOP

SCIENCE MAGAZINE

SCIENCE NOW

SCIENCE'S NEXT WAVE

HIGHWIRE JOURNALS

CURRENT ISSUE OF SCIENCE

ARCHIVES OF SCIENCE MAGAZINE

SUBJECT COLLECTIONS

ARCHIVES OF SCIENCE NOW